

# WHIP COUNT: What Democrats Are Saying About The Democrats' Cap-And-Tax Bill

Today, the President met with House Democrats about the faltering cap-and-tax bill. This meeting comes after at least 31 Democrat Senators and Representatives have expressed their outright opposition to or concern with the Democrats' cap-and-tax plan. Please see below for a full list of the 31 and what they have had to say. We will keep updating this document in the days ahead.

Sen. Evan Bayh (D-IN)  
Sen. Sherrod Brown (D-OH)  
Sen. Mary Landrieu (D-LA)  
Sen. Blanche Lincoln (D-AR)  
Sen. Mark Pryor (D-FL)  
Sen. Debbie Stabenow (D-MI)  
Rep. John Barrow (D-GA)  
Rep. Leonard Boswell (D-IA)  
Rep. Allen Boyd (D-FL)  
Rep. John Conyers (D-MI)  
Rep. John Dingell (D-MI)  
Rep. Baron Hill (D-IN)  
Rep. Jim Matheson (D-UT)  
Rep. Collin Peterson (D-MN)  
Rep. Mike Ross (D-AR)  
Rep. Chris Van Hollen (D-MD)

Sen. Jeff Bingaman (D-NM)  
Sen. Kent Conrad (D-ND)  
Sen. Carl Levin (D-MI)  
Sen. Ben Nelson (D-NE)  
Sen. John Rockefeller (D-WV)  
Rep. Jason Altmire (D-PA)  
Rep. John Boccieri (D-OH)  
Rep. Rick Boucher (D-VA)  
Rep. G.K. Butterfield (D-NC)  
Rep. Artur Davis (D-AL)  
Rep. Gene Green (D-TX)  
Rep. Sander Levin (D-MI)  
Rep. Charlie Melancon (D-LA)  
Rep. Charlie Rangel (D-NY)  
Rep. Mark Schauer (D-MI)

## The Democrats' Cap-And-Trade Proposal Will Hurt The Economy

***The Washington Post*: “Even Some Democrats Are Worried About The Impact Of A Cap-And-Trade System.”** “But even some Democrats are worried about the impact of a cap-and-trade system and are urging that the money raised through permit auctions be returned to consumers.” (Lori Montgomery, “Obama Officials Defend Budget,” *The Washington Post*, 3/4/09)

**Senator Evan Bayh (D-IN): “You Run The Risk Of Sending Jobs From Our Country...”** SEN. BAYH: “And the problem with cap and trade and global warming, Chris, is we can do that, but if you don’t do it in the right kind of way, you run the risk of sending jobs from our country, places like your home state of Pennsylvania or mine of Indiana, to other countries that have lower emission standards. So the irony would be we’d lose jobs and not help with global warming. So you can do that, but you’ve got to do it in the right way. And you’re probably going to need Democrats from states that are going to be adversely affected if it’s not done in the right way; so a little less likely on that one, although I think we can still get it done.” (MSNBC’s “Hardball,” 3/25/09)

**Senator Jeff Bingaman (D-NM): “Sees The Proposal As Too Costly For Industry.”** “Democrats and Republicans from industrial or coal-producing states also oppose Obama’s proposal to curb industrial emissions blamed for climate change. ... Senate Energy Committee Chairman Jeff Bingaman, a New Mexico Democrat, sees the proposal as too costly for industry. He suggests changes that include a mix of carbon allowances to be given to polluters along with the sale of permits.” (Thomas Ferraro, “Obama Faces Democrat Discord On Spending Plans,” *Reuters*, 3/15/09)

**Senator Sherrod Brown (D-OH): “It Really Does Say To Manufacturing, ‘Go To China, Where They Have Weaker Environmental Standards.”** “Sen. Sherrod Brown (D-Ohio), who opposed cap-and-trade last June, said that Obama’s plan would lead to an increase in energy costs and would

drive American firms abroad. 'It really does say to manufacturing, "Go to China, where they have weaker environmental standards," Brown told The Hill. 'And that's a very bad message in bad economic times — in any economic times.'" (Walter Alarkon, "Not All Senators Warming To Obama Cap-And-Trade Emissions Proposal" *The Hill*, 3/4/09)

- **Senator Brown: Cap-And-Trade Will Lead Manufacturers To Move To China.** "Coal-state lawmakers such as Sen. Sherrod Brown (D-Ohio) say Obama's proposal to cap carbon emissions would drive American manufacturers abroad. ... Brown told The Hill that he thinks caps on carbon emissions would hurt Ohio manufacturing, which relies on carbon-emitting coal plants for power, and force companies to relocate to China." (Walter Alarkon, "Devil In The Budget Details," *The Hill*, 3/6/09)

**Senator Kent Conrad (D-ND): "Unlikely" Climate Legislation Would Pass "If It Doesn't Have Money Set Aside For Industries That Will Be Especially Hard Hit."** "On Wednesday, the chairman of the Senate Budget Committee, Kent Conrad (D., N.D.), said it is 'unlikely' climate legislation will pass the Senate 'if it doesn't have money set aside for industries that will be especially hard hit.'" (Ian Talley and Stephen Power, "Democrats Tangle On Climate Change," *The Wall Street Journal*, 3/12/09)

**Senator Mary Landrieu (D-LA): "I Just Don't Think An Economy-Wide Cap And Trade Works."** "The state's other Democrat, U.S. Sen. Mary Landrieu, is also holding a critical vote that could help sink the measure. She has been a longtime opponent of cap and trade and says the proposal is even more hurtful to businesses at a time when the economy is suffering. 'I think there are other ways to reduce greenhouse gases,' Landrieu said. 'I just don't think an economy-wide cap and trade works.'" (Gerard Shields, "La. Democrats Key Figures In Federal Emissions Debate," *Baton Rouge Advocate*, 5/2/09)

**Both Senators Carl Levin (D-MI) And Debbie Stabenow (D-MI) Have Raised Concern Over Cap-And-Trade In Obama's Budget.** "Michigan's senators, reliable allies of President Barack Obama, are emerging as potential obstacles to one of his top budget priorities." (Gordon Trowbridge, "Senators May Block Obama On Emissions," *The Detroit News*, 3/19/09)

- **"Both Have Raised Major Questions About A Cap-And-Trade System To Limit Carbon Emissions. Last Week, Sen. Carl Levin, D-Detroit, Joined A Handful Of More Moderate Senate Democrats In Opposing A Procedural Move That Could Make It Easier For Such A System To Become Law."** (Gordon Trowbridge, "Senators May Block Obama On Emissions," *The Detroit News*, 3/19/09)
- **"And Sen. Debbie Stabenow Of Lansing Criticized The Administration For Tying New Money For Energy Research - Some Of Which Could Help The Auto Industry - To Passage Of A Cap-And-Trade Plan."** (Gordon Trowbridge, "Senators May Block Obama On Emissions," *The Detroit News*, 3/19/09)

**Senator Blanche Lincoln (D-AR): "I'm Saying I Hope That We'll Be Very Thorough In What The Consequences Are For All Of These Different Regions Of The Country And The People."** "She's also joined a group of Democratic senators opposing speedy action of Obama's proposal to combat global warming through a 'cap and trade' system allowing the government to auction off permits to emit greenhouse gases. 'I'm not saying it's wrong. I'm saying I hope that we'll be very thorough in what the consequences are for all of these different regions of the country and the people,' Lincoln said." (Andrew DeMillo, "Lincoln Keeps Obama At Arm's Length," *The Associated Press*, 3/23/09)

**Senator Ben Nelson (D-NE): Cap-And-Trade "Could Have A Negative Impact On Our Economy By Raising Utility Rates On Consumers."** "I also question counting revenue for cap and trade policies to deal with climate change that haven't been implemented and could have a negative impact on our economy by raising utility rates on consumers." (Senator Ben Nelson, Op-Ed, "Need To Rein In Spending, Deficit And Taxes," *The Grand Island Independent*, 3/11/09)

**Senator Mark Pryor (D-AR): “There Are Too Many Unknowns, But Right Now, It Doesn’t Pass.”** “Some important issues, including potential tax cuts to consumers to offset energy price increases and the actual allocation or auctioning of the federal permits, have yet to be decided. ‘The jury’s still out on whether it’s going to be a cap-and-trade program, a carbon tax or a different animal altogether,’ said Lincoln. (A carbon tax is a direct assessment on emissions of carbon dioxide.) ‘There are too many unknowns, but, right now, it doesn’t pass,’ Pryor predicted.” (Alex Daniels, “Climate-Change Woes Land In Congress’ Lap,” *Arkansas Democrat-Gazette*, 4/19/09)

**Senator John Rockefeller (D-WV) Spokesman: “We Need To Be Sure We Don’t Negatively Impact The Economy.”** “Sen. John D. Rockefeller IV, West Virginia Democrat, said the administration and Congress must not ignore other climate-change solutions, such as scientific research into capturing carbon dioxide and sequestering it in the ground. ‘The president’s plan for a cap-and-trade system is ambitious, but the senator is not completely convinced that it is the best or only solution to curbing carbon emissions,’ Rockefeller spokesman Steven Broderick said. ‘We need to be sure we don’t negatively impact the economy.’” (S.A. Miller, “Obama’s Cap, Trade Irk Some In Party,” *The Washington Times*, 3/2/09)

**Representative Jason Altmire (D-PA): “Any Way You Do It, It Hurts Pennsylvania, Especially Western Pennsylvania.”** “‘What I’ve seen so far is nowhere near where it needs to be for me to support it,’ Rep. Jason Altmire (D-Pa.) told POLITICO. ‘Any way you do it, it hurts Pennsylvania, especially western Pennsylvania.’ ‘I think cap and trade is bad policy,’ said Altmire.” (Alex Isenstadt, “Cap And Trade Hits Speed Bumps,” *Politico*, 4/27/09)

**Representative John Barrow (D-GA): “We Have An Awful Lot Of Work Left To Do.”** “During the first of four hearings this week on a draft 600-page cap-and-trade and energy bill from House Energy and Commerce Chairman Henry Waxman and Energy and Environment Subcommittee Chairman Edward Markey, D-Mass., Democrats with manufacturing, coal, oil and gas, and other interests offered a litany of concerns and suggestions for earning their support. ‘We have an awful lot of work left to do,’ Rep. John Barrow, D-Ga., said.” (Darren Goode, “On Opening Day Of Hearings, Dem Leaders Get An Earful,” *National Journal’s Congress Daily*, 4/22/09)

**Representative John Boccieri (D-OH): “I Have Real Concerns About The Way [The Cap-And-Trade Draft] Is Now.”** “Boccieri, a first-term Ohio Democrat whose Canton-area district narrowly went for John McCain in November, similarly signaled that while pushing through climate change legislation was a laudable goal, it had to be done with an eye toward protecting jobs. ‘I’m hearing from a lot of small businesses back at home,’ said Boccieri. ‘I have real concerns about the way [the cap-and-trade draft] is now.’” (Alex Isenstadt, “Cap And Trade Hits Speed Bumps,” *Politico*, 4/27/09)

- **Representative Boccieri: “In Its Present Form, Cap And Trade Would Be Devastating To Ohio.”** “One man expressed concern about President Obama’s proposed cap and trade tax, which would seek to limit the emission of carbon dioxide in order to mitigate global warming. ‘My understanding from what I’ve heard is it’s going to cause a big increase in our utility bills.’ Boccieri said the White House has been lobbying him heavily, but, ‘in its present form, cap and trade would be devastating to Ohio.’” (Robert Wang, “Boccieri Holds Telephone Town Hall Meeting,” *Canton Repository*, 3/25/09)

**Representative Leonard Boswell (D-IA) Says “The Prospect Of Rising Energy Costs In His Coal-Producing District ... Gave Him Pause.”** “Rep. Leonard Boswell, who occupies a historically marginal, Des Moines-based central Iowa seat, said he appreciated that President Barack Obama visited Iowa last week to promote his green jobs plan but said the prospect of rising energy costs in his coal-producing district — a district which is also home to several giant manufacturing plants — gave him pause. ‘We want to do this in a fair way,’ Boswell told POLITICO. ‘There ought to be consideration to states like Iowa and similar parts of the country.’” (Alex Isenstadt, “Cap And Trade Hits Speed Bumps,” *Politico*, 4/27/09)

**Representative Rick Boucher (D-VA): “In Its Current Form, I Cannot” Support The Democrats’ Cap-And-Tax Bill.** “A group led by Rep. Rick Boucher (D-Va.), wants to weaken the 2020 emission limits from the draft’s 20 percent cut target, bringing it down to the 6 percent level spelled out last fall in legislation he produced with former Energy and Commerce Chairman John Dingell (D-Mich.). Boucher, former chairman of the Energy and Commerce subcommittee with jurisdiction over climate change issues, said Thursday he plans to have several days of talks with Waxman. ‘And at the end of the process, I hope I’ll be able to support the bill,’ Boucher said. ‘In its current form, I cannot.’” (Darren Samuelsohn, “House Democrats Still Talking In Quest To Pass Climate Bill,” *The New York Times*, 4/27/09)

- **Representative Boucher: Emissions Cut Is “A Stretch” And “Absolutely Could Not Be Achieved.”** “In a sign of the difficulties that Democrats could face in passing climate legislation, a senior member of Mr. Waxman’s panel, Rep. Rick Boucher (D., Va.) said in an interview Tuesday that the chairman’s proposal to cut emissions 20% by 2020 is ‘a stretch’ and ‘absolutely could not be achieved,’ unless it was amended to give companies more credit for so-called offset projects that aim to cut emissions through undertakings like preventing deforestation.” (Stephen Power, “EPA Previews Carbon Caps’ Impact,” *The Wall Street Journal*, 4/22/09)

**Representative Allen Boyd (D-FL): “There Are Some Parts Of His Cap-And-Trade Proposal That Are Troublesome...”** “Boyd conceded some Blue Dogs have concerns about the cap-and-trade program for carbon emissions in Obama’s budget. The proceeds would be used to fund Obama’s signature ‘Making Work Pay’ tax credit. ‘There are some parts of his cap-and-trade proposal that are troublesome and we discussed those,’ Boyd said. ‘A lot of that has to [do with] the tax portion of it and how you use the money and whether it is a transfer of wealth from one part of the country to another and the nexus between whom you tax and what the money is used for.’” (Humberto Sanchez, “Blue Dogs Will Present Guidelines To Spratt Next Week,” *National Journal’s Congress Daily*, 3/13/09)

**Representative G.K. Butterfield (D-NC): “For A Low-Income Family, It’s Absolutely Impossible For Them To Absorb The Costs.”** “‘For a low-income family, it’s absolutely impossible for them to absorb the costs,’ he said, adding that the bill would mean higher prices on everything from food to toys to automobiles.” (Darren Samuelsohn, “House Democrats Still Talking In Quest To Pass Climate Bill,” *The New York Times*, 4/27/09)

- **Representative G.K. Butterfield: “Not Only Is It Impractical, It Is Impossible.”** “Several Democrats -- especially from the Southeast -- said a mandate for 25 percent of electricity to be produced from renewable energy sources by 2025 is too aggressive and at a minimum the definition of what power sources would qualify should be expanded. ... ‘Not only is it impractical, it is impossible,’ added Rep. G.K. Butterfield, D-N.C. He recommended the mandate could go down to perhaps 15 percent and that nuclear and biomass should be considered under the definition.” (Darren Goode, “On Opening Day Of Hearings, Dem Leaders Get An Earful,” *National Journal’s Congress Daily*, 4/22/09)

**Representative John Conyers (D-MI): “We May Have To Hold Off.”** “Judiciary Chairman John Conyers (D-Mich.) acknowledged that the issue has been discussed over and over again at leadership meetings. ‘Some have suggested that that’s too large a legislative lift to accomplish with the challenge we have ahead with universal health care, troops in Iraq and Afghanistan, the budget, and dealing with the financial crisis,’ Conyers said. ‘It is not my view that all those things can happen,’ he said, adding that there is “a great deal of tension back and forth’ in the meetings. ‘There are strongly held opinions and numerous voices on all sides,’ he said. ‘We may have to hold off.’” (Steven T. Dennis and Tory Newmyer, “Democrats Clash On Climate Change,” *Roll Call*, 5/4/09)

**Representative Artur Davis (D-AL) Opposes Cap-And-Trade.** “In sum, the Birmingham Democrat [Rep. Artur Davis (D-AL)] opposes the White House proposal to regulate carbon emissions by capping emissions and trading pollution credits; he doesn’t want former President George W. Bush’s tax cuts to automatically disappear; he objects to any possible delay in buying a new refueling tanker

for the U.S. Air Force; and he doesn't want cuts to missile defense.” (Mary Orndorff, “Davis Shifts With Critique Of Obama Budget,” *Birmingham News*, 3/18/09)

**Representative John Dingell (D-MI): “Cap-And-Trade Is A Tax And It’s A Great Big One.”**

DINGELL: “Nobody, nobody in this country realizes that cap-and-trade is a tax and it’s a great big one. I want to get a bill that works. How do we choose the best course, cap-and-trade, carbon tax? At times, my dear friend, Albert, you have been an advocate of a carbon tax as the better way to go. How do we address this problem?” (U.S. House of Representatives Energy And Commerce Committee, Hearing, 4/24/09)

**Representative Gene Green (D-TX): “I Don’t Want To Have To Vote On A Bill That Would Actually Backfire For Us.”**

“‘I want to vote for a bill,’ said Green, whose district includes oil refiners and chemical manufacturers. ‘I don’t want to have to vote on a bill that would actually backfire for us.’” (Patrick O’Connor and Lisa Lerer, “Dingell Dems Fret About Cap And Trade,” *Politico*, 4/28/09)

**Representative Baron Hill (D-IN): “The Bill In Its Current Form Is Going To Increase The Rates For The People I Represent.”**

“Among coal-district Democrats like Hill, whose southeastern Indiana seat tilts conservative, reservations about a climate change bill are equally apparent. ‘I just can’t support it with the way it’s being proposed,’ said Hill, noting that 96 percent of Indiana is dependent on coal. ‘The bill in its current form is going to increase the rates for the people I represent.’” (Alex Isenstadt, “Cap And Trade Hits Speed Bumps,” *Politico*, 4/27/09)

**Representative Sander Levin (D-MI): “If We Regulate Emissions And Other Nations Do Not, We Run The Risk That Our Environmental Objectives Will Be Defeated, As Polluters And Pollution Will Merely Migrate From The United States To Countries With Less Stringent Regulations – Taking U.S. Jobs With Them.”**

“The issue of carbon ‘leakage’ – the exodus of energy-intensive industries to nations without strict environmental laws – is a top concern to lawmakers and business owners as Congress advances climate and energy legislation this year. ‘If we regulate emissions and other nations do not, we run the risk that our environmental objectives will be defeated, as polluters and pollution will merely migrate from the United States to countries with less stringent regulations – taking U.S. jobs with them,’ said Rep. Sander Levin (D-Mich.), chairman of the Ways and Means Trade Subcommittee.” (“House Dems Aim To Curb Job ‘Leakage’ Under Cap And Trade,” *Environment And Energy Daily*, 3/25/09)

**Representative Jim Matheson (D-UT): “I Am Concerned About Moving So Quickly.”**

“The legislation highlighted by the ad is the American Clean Energy and Security Act, now being fast-tracked by a committee on which Matheson sits. The bill promotes renewable energy and energy efficiency, but also includes a ‘global warming’ section that limits heat-trapping pollutants. Matheson says the bill is not yet finalized and he wants more time to study it and seek input from those affected. ‘The draft bill we are looking at today is a huge piece of legislation,’ Matheson said at a hearing recently, bringing up 12 problems he sees with the bill. ‘It seeks to address an exceptionally complicated issue. I am concerned about moving so quickly.’ Matheson spokeswoman Alyson Heyrend says her boss agrees that freeing America from foreign oil is an important national security issue, but that the bill is only in draft form and has ‘significant blank spots on key aspects.’” (Thomas Burr, “Veterans Group Takes On Matheson Over Energy Bill,” *Salt Lake Tribune*, 4/27/09)

**Representative Charles Melancon (D-LA): “I Believe This Bill Would Create An Undue Burden On Families Who Are Already Paying Too Much In Energy Bills...”**

“At this point Melancon said he can’t support the draft because it would shut down the state’s energy coast. Melancon’s vote could have a detrimental effect on getting the measure out of committee. ‘I believe this bill would create an undue burden on families who are already paying too much in energy bills and on an industry that provides thousands of Louisianians with good jobs,’ Melancon said.” (Gerard Shields, “La. Democrats Key Figures In Federal Emissions Debate,” *Baton Rouge Advocate*, 5/2/09)

**Representative Collin Peterson (D-MN): “I Think It Is Highly Unlikely That Any Climate Change Is Going To Pass.”** “Within the Democratic caucus are members who are skeptical about the chances of passing such a sweeping change in U.S. global warming policy. ‘I think from what I’m seeing of what is developing here, I think it is highly unlikely that any climate change bill is going to pass,’ House Agriculture Chairman Collin Peterson (D-Minn.) said last week.” (Darren Samuelsohn, “Obama, House Democrats To Discuss Global Warming, Energy Bill,” *Environment And Energy Daily*, 5/4/09)

**Representative Charlie Rangel (D-NY): “Has Doubts About Using A Carbon Market – As In A Cap-And-Trade Plan.”** “House Ways and Means Chairman Charles Rangel has doubts about using a carbon market – as in a cap-and-trade plan – to regulate greenhouse gases and has also suggested that his committee should be the one to determine where revenue from a plan should be allocated.” (Darren Goode, “On Opening Day Of Hearings, Dem Leaders Get An Earful,” *National Journal’s Congress Daily*, 4/22/09)

**Representative Mike Ross (D-AR): “I’m Worried That States Like Arkansas Can’t Meet” The Cap-And-Trade Bill’s Mandate.** “Several Democrats -- especially from the Southeast -- said a mandate for 25 percent of electricity to be produced from renewable energy sources by 2025 is too aggressive and at a minimum the definition of what power sources would qualify should be expanded. ‘I’m worried that states like Arkansas can’t meet’ the mandate, Rep. Mike Ross, D-Ark., said.” (Darren Goode, “On Opening Day Of Hearings, Dem Leaders Get An Earful,” *National Journal’s Congress Daily*, 4/22/09)

- **Representative Ross: “If You Don’t Like \$4-A-Gallon Gasoline, You’re Really Not Going To Like Your Electric Bill Sometime Between Now And 2030.”** “Rep. Mike Ross, Arkansas Democrat and one of the moderate members whom party leaders will have to persuade in order to secure passage, said he was concerned about the price consumers would have to pay if utilities passed along the cost of buying carbon permits to customers. ‘If you don’t like \$4-a-gallon gasoline, you’re really not going to like your electric bill sometime between now and 2030,’ he said.” (Tom LoBianco, “House Lawmakers Take Stands In Hearings On Climate Change,” *The Washington Times*, 4/22/09)

**Representative Mark Schauer (D-MI): “We Need To Be Very Cautious About How We Move Forward.”** “My No. 1 concern is to turn around Michigan’s economy and to reverse the loss of jobs,’ said Schauer, a freshman Democrat from a southern Michigan seat with a traditionally Republican voting history. Schauer, whose district includes automobile and food processing plants, said he hasn’t decided whether to back cap and trade but said he couldn’t support it in its current form. ‘We need to be very cautious about how we move forward,’ Schauer told POLITICO in an interview.” (Alex Isenstadt, “Cap And Trade Hits Speed Bumps,” *Politico*, 4/27/09)

**Representative Chris Van Hollen (D-MD): “The Question Is Whether You Would Take It To The Floor, Or Do You Wait To See If Anything Develops On The Senate Side.”** “The House may not vote on a climate change bill this year, according to a high-ranking Democratic leader. Rep. Chris Van Hollen (D-Md.) told The Hill on Monday that leaders could opt not to bring a climate measure to the floor if the bill has little chance of passing the Senate. ... Van Hollen, 50, became the highest-ranking House Democrat to say that even if an agreement is reached, the House may not vote on a cap-and-trade bill if the bill appears to have little hope of clearing the upper chamber. ‘The first thing we need to do is see whether we can come together around a consensus position in the committees in the House, and that’s what we’re working on. And then, of course, if we were able to arrive at that, the question is whether you would take it to the floor, or do you wait to see if anything develops on the Senate side,’ Van Hollen said.” (Jared Allen, “Van Hollen: Climate Bill Could Wait,” *The Hill*, 4/27/09)

*Prepared by the Office of the Whip Press Secretary, 5/5/09*